

Exhibit 1

Babchinetskaya, Izabella (Phila)

From: Powell, Courtney <cpowell@spencerfane.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 14, 2023 4:32 PM
To: Tianna Mays; Babchinetskaya, Izabella (Phila)
Cc: Jonathan Irwin; Woody Glass; Leckerman, Jason (Phila); Watson, Travis W. (Phila); Warren, Catherine J. (Denver); Ferate, AJ; Holcum, Laura; Lester, Andy; Swaminathan, Lisa B. (Phila); Arthur Ago
Subject: RE: Reimbursement Request Status-Follow up & Discovery Issues

⚠ EXTERNAL

Below is the link to the ShareFile containing the copies of Plaintiffs' ticket jackets.

Thanks, Courtney

Courtney Powell Of Counsel
Spencer Fane LLP

9400 N. Broadway Ext., Suite 600 | Oklahoma City, OK 73114
O 405.753.5915
cpowell@spencerfane.com | spencerfane.com

From: Tianna Mays <tmays@lawyerscommittee.org>
Sent: Monday, March 13, 2023 3:39 PM
To: Powell, Courtney <cpowell@spencerfane.com>; Isabelle Babchinetskaya <BabchinetskayaI@ballardspahr.com>
Cc: Jonathan Irwin <jonathan@wardglasslaw.com>; Woody Glass <woody@wardglasslaw.com>; Jason Leckerman <leckermanj@ballardspahr.com>; Travis Watson <watsontw@ballardspahr.com>; Catherine Warren <warrenc@ballardspahr.com>; Ferate, AJ <AJFerate@spencerfane.com>; Holcum, Laura <lholcum@spencerfane.com>; Lester, Andy <alester@spencerfane.com>; Lisa Swaminathan <SwaminathanL@ballardspahr.com>; Arthur Ago <aago@lawyerscommittee.org>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] RE: Reimbursement Request Status-Follow up & Discovery Issues

[Warning] This E-mail came from an External sender. Please do not open links or attachments unless you are sure it is trusted.

Courtney,

Thank you for your email. Our team met and had additional matters to address regarding the outstanding discovery, InstaScript payment, and recent discovery submissions.

First, you stated that there are "no hard copies of previous policies nor is the VB Police Department able to access prior versions of the policies and procedures." Please confirm that the only document maintained of any former or current policies from the VB Police Department is the document previously provided.

Second, you stated VB Municipal Court does not have an Excel document maintained in Icon, rather it is a continuous spreadsheet kept in Excel with changes made every court date. Please confirm or verify 1) that only one version of this document exists, 2) the court/hearing dates/years contained in this document, and 3) if any copies or pdfs of this spreadsheet are maintained by the Defendants.

Third, after further review of the 2021 ticket jackets, very few of the ticket jackets produced are responsive to our request. Out of 153 ticket jackets, less than 30 ticket jackets address any municipal charges. Most of the ticket jackets are state

charges for 2021 and 2020 which are beyond the scope of this litigation. Please provide the municipal ticket jackets for 2021. You previously stated that 2021 had less records because of COVID; however, your records appear to show that in 2021, Valley Brook had no sole municipal court cases for the entire year. This is highly improbable.

Fourth, you provided a pdf attachment on Friday with duplicate bates numbers. Please provide us with an additional copy of the document with the bates number beginning at 5717. The last production received ended at 5716. Please let me know if your records differ.

Fifth, regarding our request, we will contact InstaScript for the payment regarding the missed deposition. Once we receive that information, we will forward it to you.

Last, we plan to file a Motion for Leave to file a supplement to our Motion to Compel prior to the oral argument on next Thursday. Please provide us with Defendants' position on our Motion for Leave by tomorrow at 12pm.

Best,

Tianna J. Mays

Associate Director, Criminal Justice Project
Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under Law
1500 K Street, Suite 900
Washington, D.C. 20005
(202) 662-8383
tmays@lawyerscommittee.org
www.lawyerscommittee.org

From: Powell, Courtney <cpowell@spencerfane.com>

Sent: Friday, March 10, 2023 7:47 PM

To: Isabelle Babchinetskaya <BabchinetskayaI@ballardspahr.com>

Cc: Tianna Mays <tmays@lawyerscommittee.org>; Jonathan Irwin <jonathan@wardglasslaw.com>; Woody Glass <woody@wardglasslaw.com>; Jason Leckerman <leckermanj@ballardspahr.com>; Travis Watson <watsonTW@ballardspahr.com>; Catherine Warren <warrenc@ballardspahr.com>; Ferate, AJ <AJFerate@spencerfane.com>; Holcum, Laura <lholum@spencerfane.com>; Lester, Andy <alester@spencerfane.com>; Lisa Swaminathan <SwaminathanL@ballardspahr.com>; Arthur Ago <aago@lawyerscommittee.org>

Subject: RE: Reimbursement Request Status-Follow up & Discovery Issues

[EXTERNAL EMAIL] This email originated outside the organization. Do not click any links or open any attachments unless you can verify the legitimacy.

All –

We are writing in response to your March 7 e-mail. As an initial matter, we sent (and you confirmed receipt of) documents labeled VB 5692 – 5716. In addition, we are attaching documents labeled VB 5356-5473.

Regarding the police policies and procedures, the document we sent to you is the only document maintained by the VB Police Department. There are no hard copies of previous policies nor is the VB Police Department able to access prior versions of the policies and procedures. The policies and procedures are modified electronically through a service called Lexipol, LLC.

With regard to the ticket jackets, we have inquired and have not located any additional ticket jackets for the years in question. We are mindful of your concern and will produce any additional ticket jackets that are located for the years in question.

As mentioned previously, we have produced the hard copies, with notes, of all the court dockets for the years in question. We spoke with Ms. Herrera regarding the Excel document. She stated that the document was not maintained in Icon but is a true spreadsheet. The Town/Court Clerk's office keeps a running version in Excel that they change out every court date. The spreadsheet does not go back to 2017, but this is the only version that exists.

We have not located the original ticket jackets for the named Plaintiffs. However, we were advised that a copy of their ticket jackets does exist. We have requested that the documents be sent to us by today, but we may not receive them until Monday.

While we disagree with your characterization of the events related to the January 11, we have considered your request to be reimbursed. As stated in our previous correspondence, we contacted your office as soon as we learned about the conflict in an attempt to resolve the issue before additional costs were incurred. To this end, we will agree to pay \$508 to resolve this issue. We believe this is reasonable when all circumstances are considered. Please advise where and to whom payment should be remitted.

We will be sending an update as to the remaining document/item requests next week.

Have a great weekend –

Courtney

Courtney Powell Of Counsel
Spencer Fane LLP

9400 N. Broadway Ext., Suite 600 | Oklahoma City, OK 73114
O 405.753.5915
cpowell@spencerfane.com | spencerfane.com

From: Babchinetskaya, Izabella <BabchinetskayaI@ballardspahr.com>

Sent: Thursday, March 9, 2023 8:51 PM

To: Powell, Courtney <cpowell@spencerfane.com>

Cc: Tianna Mays <tmays@lawyerscommittee.org>; Jonathan Irwin <jonathan@wardglasslaw.com>; Woody Glass <woody@wardglasslaw.com>; Leckerman, Jason <LeckermanJ@ballardspahr.com>; Watson, Travis W. <watsontw@ballardspahr.com>; Warren, Catherine J. <warrenc@ballardspahr.com>; Ferate, AJ <AJFerate@spencerfane.com>; Holcum, Laura <lholkum@spencerfane.com>; Lester, Andy <alester@spencerfane.com>; Swaminathan, Lisa B. <SwaminathanL@ballardspahr.com>; Arthur Ago <aago@lawyerscommittee.org>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] RE: Reimbursement Request Status-Follow up & Discovery Issues

[Warning] This E-mail came from an External sender. Please do not open links or attachments unless you are sure it is trusted.

Thank you, Courtney. This version is legible.

From: Powell, Courtney <cpowell@spencerfane.com>

Sent: Thursday, March 9, 2023 12:01 PM

To: Babchinetskaya, Izabella (Phila) <BabchinetskayaI@ballardspahr.com>

Cc: Tianna Mays <tmays@lawyerscommittee.org>; Jonathan Irwin <jonathan@wardglasslaw.com>; Woody Glass <woody@wardglasslaw.com>; Leckerman, Jason (Phila) <LeckermanJ@ballardspahr.com>; Watson, Travis W. (Phila) <watsontw@ballardspahr.com>; Warren, Catherine J. (Denver) <warrenc@ballardspahr.com>; Ferate, AJ <AJFerate@spencerfane.com>; Holcum, Laura <lholkum@spencerfane.com>; Lester, Andy <alester@spencerfane.com>;

Swaminathan, Lisa B. (Phila) <SwaminathanL@ballardspahr.com>; Arthur Ago <aago@lawyerscommittee.org>

Subject: RE: Reimbursement Request Status-Follow up & Discovery Issues

 **EXTERNAL**

Izabella –

I have attached to this email documents 5692-5716. If there are still problems with the documents, please let me know.

Thanks,
Courtney

Courtney Powell Of Counsel
Spencer Fane LLP

9400 N. Broadway Ext., Suite 600 | Oklahoma City, OK 73114
O 405.753.5915
cpowell@spencerfane.com | spencerfane.com

From: Powell, Courtney

Sent: Tuesday, March 7, 2023 8:23 PM

To: Babchinetskaya, Izabella <BabchinetskayaI@ballardspahr.com>

Cc: Tianna Mays <tmays@lawyerscommittee.org>; Jonathan Irwin <jonathan@wardglasslaw.com>; Woody Glass <woody@wardglasslaw.com>; Leckerman, Jason <LeckermanJ@ballardspahr.com>; Watson, Travis W.

<watsontw@ballardspahr.com>; Warren, Catherine J. <warrenc@ballardspahr.com>; Ferate, AJ

<AJFerate@spencerfane.com>; Holcum, Laura <lholkum@spencerfane.com>; Lester, Andy <alester@spencerfane.com>;

Swaminathan, Lisa B. <SwaminathanL@ballardspahr.com>; Arthur Ago <aago@lawyerscommittee.org>

Subject: RE: Reimbursement Request Status-Follow up & Discovery Issues

Izabella –

We will have an answer to you by end of business on March 10.

All ticket jacket boxes have been produced to you/iDoxs in the same manner that they were provided to our office. We have made inquiries regarding Plaintiff ticket jackets (prior to today's e-mail) but they have not yet been located.

With regard to the discrepancy in the amount of ticket jackets, we have not withheld any documentation from you. We have relayed to you the reasoning for the decrease in ticket jackets. We have again followed up our client, and if we learn any additional information, we will forward the same to you. With regard to the court dockets, you are in possession (in PDF format) of the court dockets that were printed for the years 2017 – 2021 containing notations about what occurred during the court proceedings.

With regard to the remainder of the items in your e-mail, we will resend the documents in full. We were unaware that there was an error in transmission. If there were different policies in place for the relevant years, we will produce the same.

Thanks,
Courtney

Courtney Powell Of Counsel
Spencer Fane LLP

9400 N. Broadway Ext., Suite 600 | Oklahoma City, OK 73114
O 405.753.5915
cpowell@spencerfane.com | spencerfane.com

From: Babchinetskaya, Izabella <BabchinetskayaI@ballardspahr.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 7, 2023 9:11 AM
To: Powell, Courtney <cpowell@spencerfane.com>
Cc: Tianna Mays <tmays@lawyerscommittee.org>; Jonathan Irwin <jonathan@wardglasslaw.com>; Woody Glass <woody@wardglasslaw.com>; Leckerman, Jason <LeckermanJ@ballardspahr.com>; Watson, Travis W. <watsontw@ballardspahr.com>; Warren, Catherine J. <warrenc@ballardspahr.com>; Ferate, AJ <AJFerate@spencerfane.com>; Holcum, Laura <lholkum@spencerfane.com>; Lester, Andy <alester@spencerfane.com>; Swaminathan, Lisa B. <SwaminathanL@ballardspahr.com>; Arthur Ago <aago@lawyerscommittee.org>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] RE: Reimbursement Request Status-Follow up & Discovery Issues

[Warning] This E-mail came from an External sender. Please do not open links or attachments unless you are sure it is trusted.

Courtney,

I am emailing to address several discovery concerns. First, you indicated that Defendants would provide a response regarding Plaintiffs' reimbursement request by March 2, 2023. We have not yet received Defendants' response. Indeed, we have now been waiting on a response for over a month. If we do not receive a response by March 10, we will proceed with a Motion for Sanctions.

Second, we received all ticket jackets for 2020. Our clients' information should have been included in the 2020 boxes. The 2020 boxes, however, did not include our clients' ticket jackets. Please provide us with their ticket jackets immediately, as well as an explanation as to why they were not included in the 2020 boxes.

Third, as we previously mentioned, Defendants produced significantly fewer ticket jackets for 2021 than for other years. Idoxs recently told us that there are about 153 ticket jackets for the entire year. When we initially raised this concern, you indicated that there are fewer ticket jackets in 2020 and 2021 due to COVID. However, the docket sheets, collections spreadsheet, and officer summary that Defendants produced indicate that well over 153 people appeared in Valley Brook Municipal Court in 2021. Significantly, as a comparison, we received 1,253 ticket jackets for 2020. Please provide an explanation as to where those ticket jackets are located. Also, at her deposition, Ms. Herrera testified that the court maintains Excel version of docket sheets, which are printed from the Icon system. These are documents that are maintained electronically and should have already been produced. Therefore, please produce these documents by March 10 for years 2017 – present. In particular, Excel versions of the 2021 docket sheets will allow us to confirm the number of municipal defendants for 2021.

Fourth, Defendants uploaded two documents on February 24. Upon an initial review, VB 5692 is a blank 25-page document—it only has a confidential stamp on each page. Please reproduce VB 5692 in a legible format. VB 5356 appears to be certain police department policies dated October 2022. Please provide the policies requested in our June 23, 2022 RFPs, which include policies from 2017 – present by March 10.

Thank you,
Izabella

From: Tianna Mays <tmays@lawyerscommittee.org>

Sent: Tuesday, February 21, 2023 10:36 AM

To: Powell, Courtney <cpowell@spencerfane.com>

Cc: Jonathan Irwin <jonathan@wardglasslaw.com>; Woody Glass <woody@wardglasslaw.com>; Babchinetskaya, Izabella (Phila) <Babchinetskayal@ballardspahr.com>; Leckerman, Jason (Phila) <LeckermanJ@ballardspahr.com>; Watson, Travis W. (Phila) <watsontw@ballardspahr.com>; Warren, Catherine J. (Denver) <warrenc@ballardspahr.com>; Ferate, AJ <AJFerate@spencerfane.com>; Holcum, Laura <lholkum@spencerfane.com>; Lester, Andy <alester@spencerfane.com>; Swaminathan, Lisa B. (Phila) <SwaminathanL@ballardspahr.com>; Arthur Ago <aago@lawyerscommittee.org>

Subject: Reimbursement Request Status-Follow up

 **EXTERNAL**

Courtney,

Emailing to follow up about the status of our reimbursement request from our January 2023 letter. As you may recall, last week, Justin Nelson testified that he was never informed of a deposition in the month of January including January 10, January 11, or January 12. He further testified that the first he ever spoke with you about a deposition was last Tuesday. This is despite the court reporter and Plaintiffs' counsel waiting for his arrival on January 11th based on your representations that he was enroute to the deposition.

You previously indicated that you would have an answer to our request by last Tuesday. Please let us know the status of our request as soon as possible.

Best,

Tianna J. Mays

Associate Director, Criminal Justice Project

Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under Law

1500 K Street, Suite 900

Washington, D.C. 20005

(202) 662-8383

tmays@lawyerscommittee.org

https://link.edgепilot.com/s/c8f1743d/ggRU66_ttkidt63mI1Siyg?u=http://www.lawyerscommittee.org/

Links contained in this email have been replaced. If you click on a link in the email above, the link will be analyzed for known threats. If a known threat is found, you will not be able to proceed to the destination. If suspicious content is detected, you will see a warning.